,QFRUSRUDWLRQ RI WKH 2WWRPDQ (PSL

accumulation at the core. The zone is exploited chiefly for raw materials and forced to import finished products from the core. The notion of exploitation is key to an understanding of Wallerstein's view of the capitalist world-a4(t)2(h)10(e c)4(a)2(al)6]a6(ng)10(o)1(ng

Shift in exports to raw materials

$ VKLIWV LQ SRUWV IURP OX[XU\ JRRGV WR UDZ PDWHULDO
WKH ZRUOG\V :DOOHUVWHLQ DQG .DVDED QRWHG W
HLJKWHHQWK FHQWXU\ D FRQVLGHUDEOH IUDFWLRQ
FRPSULVHG PHGLFDO FURSV HVSHFLDOO\ FRWWRQ PD
SURYLGHG QR KDUG HYLGHQFH WR VXSSRUW WKLV F

:KDW ZDV RFFXUULQJ ZDV QRW D VKLIW IURP WUDGH
PDWHULDOV EXW UDWKHU D VKLIW LQ WKH SDWWHUQ RI
0F*RZDQ 2WWRPDQ WUDGH LQ UDZ PDWHULDOV ZDV
ZKHDW DQG VLON LQ WKH VL[WHHQWK FHQWXU\ DW
LQFOXGH FDWWOH ZRRO PRKDLU KLGHV DQG ILQD
VHYHQWHHQWK FHQWXU\ 2WWRPDQ UDZ H[SRUWV ZH
JUDLQ H[SRUWV IURP %DOWLF WUDGH 0RUHRYHU D
WR EH H[SRUWHG LQ ODUJH TXDQWLWLHV GXULQJ W
SDUWLFXODU KDG ORQJ EHHQ FXOWLYDWHG LQ $QDV
WKH SULQFLSOH H[SRUWV RI WKH HPSLUH VLQFH WK

$V WR GDWH RI RULJLQ oLIWOLNV GHYHORSHG FKLH

VWLIOHG FRPPHUFLDO FRPSHWLWLRQ ZLWKLQ WKH 2
E\ WKH -DQLVVDULHV $IWHU WKH -DQLVVDULHV ZHU
UHVWULFW WUDGH DQG WKH VWDWH FRXOG SURPRW
HYHQW D ZHOO H[HFXWHG EORRGEDWK DQG 6WDYU

%RWK 4XDWDHUW DQG KHDGTXDUWHUV DUH ORFDWHG LQ WKH 2WWRPDQ
FKDQJH DQG ORFDO HQWUHSUHQHXUVKLS LQ WKH VH
FRQWULEXWHG WR LPSUHVVLYH FXOWXUDO DQG HFR
ZKLFK IDLO WR VSHDN WR SHULSKHUDOL]DWLRQ DQG
:DOOHUVWHLQ DQG .DVDED V FODLP WKDW LQ WKH
WKH 2WWRPDQ (PSLUH RQ WKH ZRUOG

3RLWLFDO)DFWRUV
4XHVWLRQV RQ :DOOHUVWHLQ V $QDO\VLV

%DFN WR RULJLQDO DUWLFOH

/DVW 8SGDWHG

H[SDQGHG ZLWK FRQTXHVWV RI QHZ ODQG WLPDU O
UHWXUQ IRU PLOLWDU\ GXWLHV 7KH ODQG UHYHUWH
7KH ODQG ZDV FXOWLYDWHG E\ SHDVDQWV ZKR RZQ
ZKRVH ULJKWV DQG REOLJDWLRQV WR WKH VLSDKL D

$IWKH 2WWRPDQV IDLOHG WR WDNH 9LHQQD LQ
H[SDQVLRQ EXW WKLV ZDV QRW FULWLFDO (YHQ EH
RXWGDWHG ILJKWLQJ IRUFH DQG ZHUH JUDGXDOO\ U
ILUHDUPV SHDVDQWV DQG ODQGLWV UHSODFHG WKHP LQ SULY
QRWDEOHV D\DQV $GDQLU WKH HQHUWHGD WKDW FKDQ
RYHUD[LWDWLRQ EULJDQGDJH FOLPDWH FKDQJH FURS

dLIWOLNV HPHUJHG WKLQHVXL[WRP SULYDWH SHDVD
VWDWH ODQG %\ WKLV WLPH WKH VLSDKL KDG JDLQ
EHFDPH PRUH FRPPRQ LQ WKH VHYHQWHHQWK DQG H
GHYRWHG FKLHIO\ WR FDSWXUHG ODQG $GDQLU F
%DONDQV DV ZHOO DV LQ $QDWROLD WKH SDUW SOD
UHPDLQHG UDWKHU QHJOLJLEOH

Rise of local notables

:DOOHUVWHLQ DQG .DSDED FODLPHG WKDW GLVRUJD
ORVV RI 2WWRPDQ FRQWURO RYHU SURYLQFLDO RIIL
IXQFWLRQ ZDV WR UHSUHVHQW WKH SHRSOH LQ WKH
VXEVWDQWLDO SRZHUV **WD** EOLVKHG XQFRQ
UHJLRQ WKURXJK WKH SURFHVVHV RI oLIWOLN IRUPD

+LVWRULDQV DJUHH WKDW D\DQ ZHUH DEOH WR GH
HLJKWHHQWK FHQWXU\ 6RPH D\DQ ZHUH OHVV LQW
ILOOLQJ D YDFXXP ZKHUH WKH FHQWUDO SRZHU ZDV
WKH\ DWWHPSWHG WR PDLQWDLQ D VHQVH RI RUGHU
DQG 2VPDQ 3DVYDQRJOX IUHTXHQWO\ RUJDQL]HG EI
RWKHU IRU FRQWURO RI WHUULWRU\ DQG JHQHUDOO
FRQVLGHUDEOH ORVV RI OLIH

:LWKRXW WKH oLIWOLN DUJXPHQW :DOOHUVWHLQ FR
RI WKH 2WWRPDQ (PSLUH HLQRRWKH%XSLQRDOOZ
SHDVDQW ODQG WUDQVIRUPLQJ WKH SHDVDQWV LQ
SODQWDWLRQ 4XLWH WKH UHYHUVH ,W ZDV WKH
FDXVHG SHDVDQWV WR DEDQGRQ ORZODQG FRPPXQL
WKH\ HVWDEOLVKHG UXUDO PDQXIDFWXULQJ ZRUNVKR
ERRP GHVFULEHG E\ 3DLODUHW ,W FDQQRW EH FRLQ

WRZQRVSULYVKWLWVD .RWHO 6ZHSURHW W*KDEURRFYRV DQG
%XOJDFXDQXUDO UHYLYDO WKDWQLEHJDQHLQWKDFHQWXU

Demands for political autonomy

:DOOHUVWHLQ DQG .DVDED LQGLFDWHG WKDW QDWL
WKH %DONDQV LQ WKH HDUO\ QLQHWHHQWK ZHUH W
WKDW WKH PHUFKDQW HOLWH VXFFHVVIXOO\ PRELOL
XQGHU WKH EDQQHU RI QDWLRQDOLVP WR FKDOOHQJH WKH
7KH PHUFKDQW HOLWH LQ WKH %DONDQV QDWXUDOO\ VRXJKW
2WWRPDQ UXOH :KLOH PDQ\ PHUFKDQWV FRQWULEX
IHZ RI WKHP QXUWXUHG UHYROXWLRQDU\ LGHDV 7K
HOLWH $QG QHLWKHU WKH PHUFKDQWV ZLWKLQ WKH L
SHDVDQWV ZKR LQ DQ\ FDVH DV 0DU[KLPVHOI QRV

Inadequate diplomacy

:DOOHUVWHLQ DQG .DVDED QRWHG WKDW ZLWK LWV
IRUWXQHV LQ ZDU WKH 2WWRPDQ (PSLUH EHJDQ WR
FRQVHTXHQFH RI WKH WUHDWLHV RI %HOJUDGH
2WWRPDQV PDGH GLSORPDWLF DQG HFRQRPLF FRQF
)UDQFH DOORZLQJ QR OLWWOH LQWHUIHUHQFH LQ
UHODWLRQV EHWZHHQ WKH (PSLUH DQG WKH ZRU@UG

PDUJLQDOL]HG 2WWRPDQ DJHQF\ DQG LJQRUHG FXOW
HLJKWHHQWK FHQWXU\ WKH 2WWRPDQ (PSLUH ZDV Y
FKDQJH 7KH LPSHWXV IRU UHIRUP FDPH IURP ZLWKL
DUH DOO SDUW RI WKH VDPH WUDQVIRUPDWLRQ

(FRQRPLF)DFWRUV
4XHVWLRQV RQ :DOOHUVWHLQ V $QDO\VLV

%DFN WR RULJLQDO DUWLFOH

/DVW 8SGDWHG

Dc Ô 0 (} ‡ r Á +Ü ` p R x HP

QHWZRUN WJRRGSVUHQVHWWZRHUN WKH SROLWLFDO PLOLV
JRRGV QHWZRUN :LDOOVRPVWHLQVWKWHW WSHUFKG
EHQHILW LQ FODULW\ DQG SRZHU LI LW ZHUH WLHG
QHWZRUN

Sources

0XFK RI WKH HYLGHQFH , KDYH FLWHG DJDLQVW :DO
LQFRUSRUDWLRQ FRQWR\ZKW ZRUGX FHG E\ VFKRODU
DUJXPHQWV VSHFLILFDOO\ DJDLQVW KLP /DPSH IRU
PDOLJQDQW ZRUOG V\VWHP IOLHV LQ WKH IDFH RI
KLVWRU\ ,W DOVRWKHLUVHWR UHVWDLQWV RQ WKH D
DUJXHG WKDW WKH QDWXUH RI 2WWRPDQ KHJHPRQ\
WKH 2WWRPDQ DQG +DEVEXJ HPSLUHV KDG D UHWI
VXJJHVWHG WKDW FKDOSHUDWHG WRDSRHR7XUNLVK
DEVROYHG 2WWRPDQ KHJHPRQ\ RI LWV UHWDUGLQJ

3DLODUHW DOVR WDUJHWHG :DOOHUVWHLQ GLUHFWO
WKH 2WWRPDQ (PSLUH KDVHEHQSOKHRGLXSXWDULVRP
DQG WKH FUHDWLRQ RI GHSHQGHQF\ DW WKH (XURS
UHKHDUVHG YLHZ KDV EHHQ HQGRUVHG E\ :DOOHUV
SDUW 3DLODUHW DUJXHG WKDW WQKHXQGHUZHQWKDQ
ILUVW KDOI RI WKH QLQHWHHQWK FHQWXU\ KDG D SU
HYROXWLRQ L`Q WKH %DONDQV ISDUWLFXODUO\ %XOJ

2WWRPDQ (PSLUH ZDV VWLOO SODLQHG DQG WEQXOGV KDZURGUOO

The Identity of Black Women in the Post-Bellum Period 1865-1885

Carl Greenfeld

7KURXJKRXW KLVWRU\ WKH EODFN ZRPDQ KDV DOZD
WKUXVW XSRQ KHU VKRXOGHUV 7KLV ZDV QHYHU WU
SHUERGZHHQ DQG ,Q WKLV VSDQ RI WZHQW\
UHVSRQVLEOH IRU WKHLU FKLOGUHQ WKHLU KXVEDQ
IUHHGRP DV EODFN FLWL]HQV DQG DV ZRPHQ WKHLU
LVVXHV DFKDHG LWV HLU OLYHV $OO RI WKHVH DVSHFW
ZKR VKH ZDV (DFK RI KHU H[SHULHQFHV DQG EDWWO
WKH ZD\ VKH ZDV SHUFHLYHG E\ WKH RXWVLGH ZRUO

:KR ZHUH WKHVH ZRPHQ DQG LQ WKH EODFN WKHH [SHUH
ZHUH" 7KLV HVVD\ ZLOO DUJXH WKDW WKHVH ZRPHQ
LQ ZKLFK WKH\ KDQGOHG WKH GLIIHUHQW UHVSRQVL
H[SRVHG WR LQ WKH DIWHUPDWWK RI VODYHU\ 7KHLU
ZKR WKH\ ZHUH RQO\ E\ ORRNLQJ DW WKH LGHQWLW
VWXGLHG DQG H[SORUHG ,Q WKLV HVVD\ WKH VRXW
VH[XDO LGHQWLW\ IDPLO\ LGHEDWHLWV DQG JHQGHU
FRXUVH PDQ\ PRUH VSHFLILF DVSHFWV RI WKHVH ZR
WKDW IXUQLVK WKH FOHDUHVW DQG PRVW VSHFLILF
WKURXJK WKHVH IRXU DVSHFWV LGHQWLW\ RSSUHVVLRQ
FDQ EH GUDZQ 2QH ZLOO EH DEOH WR UHFRQL]H W
HIIRUW WKH\ SXW IRUWK LQ RUGHU WR EH VHHQ DV

2FFXSDWLRQDO ,GHQWLW\

,Q WKH SHULRG DIWHU ZDU WKHUH&LYLO RU DZD\ WR WKH
ZRPDQ VKH ZDV IUHH IRU WKH ILUVW WLPH DQG ZDQ
LQGHSHQGHQFH 2QH RI WKH ILUVW WKLQJV WKDW W
KHU IUHHGRP ZDV WR REWDLQ D MRE 7KHVH ZRPHQ
ZRXOG QRW EH HTXDOV MXVW EHFDXVH WKH\ ZHUH
WR EODFN ZRPHQ OLNH PDQ\ RWKHU DVSHFWV RI W
WKDQ WKH MREV RIIHUHG WR ZKLWH GHEWORRI ZRSH
H[WHQGHG KRXUV DQG ZRXOG SXW WKHP LQ FRQVW
QHJRWLDWH WKH OLWHUDO URXJK WHUUDLQ RI $WOD
WKHLU HYHU\GD\ OLYHV DV WRKH\WKHUX JDPLGLWR EDQ
IRU SHDFH RI PLQG ´ 7KH\ ZRXOG KDYH WR SHUVHYH
WKHLU KRXVHKROG

7KHVH ZRPHQ KDG QR FKRLFH EXW WR ZRUN DQG WI
WKDW

IRU 0DULDK %DOGZLQ 2Q WKH GD\ WKH\ ZHUH WR

2QH RI WKH EODFN ZRPHQ¶V PDLQ JRUDFHDWDU WK
SRVVLEOH IURP DQ\ DVSHFWV RI VODYHU\ WKDW UHP
WR ZDON DZD\ IURP WKH SODQWDWLRQ WR JR LQ VH
UHPLQGHUV RI WKHLU IRUPHU VWDWXV ´ 7KH\ GLG W
WKHLU IDPLOLHV DZD\ IURP WKH SODQWDWLRQV DQG
PRYLQJ DZD\ WKHVH ZRPHQ PDGH PDQ\ RI WKHLU HF
IHOW WKH\ ZHUH ORVLQJ D SRUWLRQ RI WKHLU HQGXU
ZRUNHUV 7KH EODFN ZRUNLQJ ZRPDQ GLG QRW FDU

7KH GHVLUH WR GLVWDQFH WKHPVHOYHV SK\VLFDOO
WKHLU SULRULWLHV ,Q D ZDONLQJ FXOWXUH WKHVH
OLYH LQ DUHDV WKDW ZHUH ZLWKLQ HDV\ UHDFK E\ I
DGXLWRQEH•€DF Àg$Œ (#!wÒ 7KH $ˆVLU XWFDM € gf DRÀ O

DQG IDPLOLHV 7KHVH VWULNHV DOORZHG WKHP WR
VDODULHV DQG FRPSHOOHG WKHLU SRZHU WR GHFUHDVH
WKHLU OLYHV ,Q WKH HYHQW WKDW VWULNHV GLG
GLG DOORZ WKHVH ZRPHQ WR VWDQG XS IRU WKHPV
WR ZRUN PRUH DUGXRXVO\ )HDZ WKLQJV
MXELODQW WKHQ KHDULQJ WKDW ³UDWKHU WKDQ JL
KXVEDQGV¶ VDODULHV µVRPH RI WKH ILUVW ODGLHV
UHDG\ WR FDUU\ WKHLU DFFRPSOLVKPHQWV LQWR W
VWDQGLQJ XS WR WKRVH ZKR KDG RSSUHVVHG WKHP
HPSOR\HUV OLYHV PRUH GLIILFXOW

7KH EODFN ZRPDQ¶V RFFXSDWLRQDO LGHQWLW\ LQ
VPSHYOLHYPROPSHVPRHUYHOLYU OLLUHSPRO

7KH EODFN ZRPDQ¶V VH[XDO LGHQWLWLHV GLZDWKRQSHR W
FRPSRVHG RI FRQVWDQW IHDU PL[HG ZLWK HPSRZHU
DEXVH SHUPHDWHG WKHLU HQWLUH OLYHV IURP WKH
H[LVWHQFH LQ WKHLU KRPH 7KHUH ZDV DOPRVW QR
³SUHGDWRU´ 7KHVH ZRPHQ GLG KRZHYHU LIJKWRE
NQRZQ WR WKH DXWKRULWLHV DQG WKH IUHHGPHQ¶
VLWXDWLRQV WKDW PLJKW KDYH WKH SRWHQWLDO W
H[SHULHQFH XQGHU WKH LQVWLWXWLRQ RI VODYHU\
WKHLU DFWLRQV DQG WKHLU ERGLHV 7KH\ ZHUH LQ
LGHQWLW\ IURP SHUYDVLYH VRXWKHUQ IRUFHV

)DPLO\ ,GHQWLW\
*HQGHU ,GHQWLW\

Back to original article.

/DVW 8SGDWHG

The Identity of Black Women in the Post-Bellum Period 1865-1885

Carl Greenfeld

Family Identity

7KH UROH RI IDPLO\ ZDV DOVR YHU\ LPSRUWDQW WR
:DU 7KH\ ZRXOG QR ORQJHU KDYH WR ZRUU\ DERXW
DZD\ IURP WKHP 7KH\ ZRXOG QR ORQJHU KDYH WR G
KXVEDQG LQKDELWHG D GLIIHUHQWKHDQYHDWLRQH W
IUHHGRP WKHVH ZRPHQ QRZ KDG DOORZHG WKHP WR
PDUULDJHV RQ D OHJDO IRRWLQJYEHWRWHHQ WKH LD
WRJHWKHU WR PDNH GHFLVLRQV DERXW WKHLU DQG
XQVFUXP` 3`Ð\ pHÐ`0GR `0W pHHGRP HG H@Vô\

,Q WKH DIWHUPDWK RI VODYHU\ EODFN ZRPHQ RIWH
ZLWK WKHP 7KH\ KDG KXVEDQGV DQG FKLOGUHQ ZK
ZKHUH WKH\ PLJKW KDYH GLHG RU PDUULHG RWKHU
GHWHUPLQHG WR UHEXLOG WKHLU IDPLOLHV 2QH RI
VODYHU\ ZDV DWWHPSW WR ORFDWH I

7KH HIIHFW RI WKLV QHZ UHVSRQVLEL[illegible] RQ WKH
GLVFXVVHG HDUOLHU LQ WKLV HVVD\ WKH P0WKHV

WKHP RU IRU EODFN PHQ ZDV WKH NH\ WR WKHLU F
VXIIUDJHPHDVQV WR DQ HQG 0XFK RI WKH LPSRUWDQ
ZDV SRODUL]HG DURXQG WKH QHZO\ SURSRVHG ILIW

7KH EDWWOH IRU WKH ULJKW WR YRWH ZDV D JRRG
ZRPHQ DIWHU WKH &LYLO :DU ,Q WKLV WLPH SHULRG
WR YRWH UHYROYHG DURXQG WKH ILIWHHQWK DPHQ
SURSRVHG LQ ZDV WR JXDUDQWHH EODFN PHQ
FDPSV KRZHYHU WKDW GLVDJUHHG XSRQ WKH SURS
DPHQGPHQW 7KHUH ZHUH WKRVH ZRPHQ ZKR IRXJKW
ZLWK EODFN ZRPDQ ZDLWLQJ WKHLU WXUQ 7KHUH Z
WKH\ GHVHUYHG WKH ULJKW WR YRWH DV WKRVH ZKR EHOLHY
³ZRPHQ VKRXOG VWHS EDFN DQG ZDLW WKHLU WXUQ
VR GHVSHUDWHO\ QHHGHG SROLWLFDO SRZHU ´ ,Q ID
&ROXPELD 8QLYHUVLW\ VWDWHV D³JUHDW EODFN ZRKH
HQIUDQFKLVHPHQW RI EODFN PHQ ZRXOG UHSUHVHQ
EODFN FRPPXQLW\ ´ 7KHVH ZRPHQ EHOLHYHG WKDW
IRU E\ ILUVW PDNLQJ VXUH WKDW EODFN PHQ DFKLH
ZRPHQ EHOLHYHG WKDW WKH ULJKW WR YRWH IRU E
VKRXOG EH LQFOXGHG ZLWKLQ WKH ILIWHHQWK DPH
WKHVH ZRPHQ DWWHQGHG UDOOLHV RU WDONHG WR U
DOORZLQJ EODFN PHQ WR DFTXLUH WKH ULJKW WR Y
FLWL]HQV DQG WKHUHIRUH VKRXOG KDYH HTXDO SUL

$OWKRXJK WKHUH ZHUH GLIIHUHQW YLHZV RQ ZKHWK
LPPHGLDWH ULJKWDQG RLPSRUWDQW WUHDWLVH ZDULW\ EHWZ
EHOLHYHG WKDW WKH\ ZHUH GRLQJ ZKDW ZDV LQ WK
WLPH SHULRG 7KH TXHVWLRQ RI WKH ULJKWQHVV R
%RWK JURXSV VKRZHG WKHLU VWUHQJWK RI FKDUDF
DGYDQWDJHRXV IRU WKHLU UDFH DQG JHQGHU UHJD
WKLV LVVXH 7KH ZRPHQ ZKR ZDQWHG WR ZDLW EHO
VXUH WKDW EODFN PHQ JRW VXIIUDJH VR WKDW WKH
WKHLU IDPLO\ 7KRVH ZKR ZDQWHG LPPHGLDWH VXII
JXDUDQWHH WKHLU IUHHGRP ZDV WKURXJK LQVWDQW
EODFN PDOH RU IHPDOHG(LWWKHUZD\ RQHEHOLHYHG
FRQWLQXHG IUHHGRP DQG ORQJ WHUP SURVSHULW\
DPHQGPHQW ZDV SDVVHG DQG RQO\ EODFN PHQ ZRX
LPSRUWDQW LVVXH KRZHYHU ZDV WKDW³EOACK ZR
ZLWK WKHLU KXVEDQGV DQG IDWKHUV %XW WKH\ GL
7KH\ VKRZHG WKDW WKH\ ZRXOG ILJKW IRU ZKDW WK
HYHQ LI LW LQFOXGHG GLVDJUHHLQJ ZLWK RWKHU P

7KHUH LV RQH PRUH SRLQW WR EH PDGH RQ WKH JH
2QO\ RQH VSHFLILF H[DPSOH WKH ZRPHQ¶V VXIIUDJ
HVVD\ WR VKRZ WKH JHQGHU LGHQWLW\ RI WKH IUHH
LGHQWLW\ RI WKHVH ZRPHQ KRZHYHU LV DOVR FRPSR
VH[XDO DQG IDPLO\ WKDW KDYH EHHQ GLVFXVVHG
VXFK DV ORZHU SD\ DW ZRUN VH[XDO DEXVH DQG E
DUHD DQG SHULHQFHV DQG UHVSRQVLELOLWLHV WKDW Z
ZRPDQ DQG ZKLFK FRQWULEXWHG WR KHU JHQGHU L
EHFDXVH LW VKRZV WKDW QRW DOO WKH LGHQWLWLH
WKLV HHUDXZHU DOO\ H[FOXVLYH EXW ZRUNHG WRJHWK
RWKHU $OWKRXJK LW PLJKW DSSHDU LQ WKLV HVVD
H[LVW DSDUW IURP RQH DQRWKHU WKH\ DUH LQGHH

7KH VRXWKHUQ EODFN ZRPDQ ZHQW WKURXJK PDQ\ K
&LYLO :DU $W WKH RXWVHW RI WKLV WLPH SHULRG
HPDQFLSDWLRQ ZDV RQO\ WKH ILUVW VWHS RQ WKH
REVWDFOHV DORQJ WKH ZD\ ZRXOZHUHHIRUFHGWRZH
OLWWOH SD\ VH[XDOO\ DEXVHG IRUFHG WR UHFUHD
H[SRVHG WR D PXOWLWXGH RI RWKHU GHJUDGDWLRQ
FRQVWDQW WKURXJKRXW WKHVWUHHSHWKHQGHVUHZH
$IULFDQ $PHULFDQ ZRPHQ GLVSOD\HG WKURXJK WKH
FRPSHQVDWHG OHVV WKDQ VKH GHVHUYHG RU ZDV V
TXLW RU ZHQW RQ VWULNH XQWLO VKH VHFXUHG ZKD
EHHQ VROG DZD\ GXULQJ WKH DJH RI VODYHU\ VKH
WR UHFODLP WKHP 7KHVH ZRPHQ KDG WKH VWUHQJV
LQ WKH ILHOGV RU LQ DQ HPSOR\HU¶V KRPH DOO GD
KRPH DQG FDUH IRU WKHLU KXVEDQGV DQG FKLOGUH

2QH ZRXOG PRVW OLNHO\ GHVFULEH WKHVH ZRPHQ D
SHUVLVWHQW 7KH UHVXOW RI WKHLU H[SHULHQFHV
LGHQWLW\ ZDV WKHLU FRPELQHG HIIRUWV WKH GLIILFXOWLHV LQ W
DFFHSWDQFH ZDV WKH NH\ WR OLYLQJ WKH NLQG RI
WR ILJKW WKH EDWWOHV WKDW WKH\ FRXOG DQG SR
IXWXUH SURVSHFWV IRU KDSSLQHVV 7KH LGHQWLW\
VXEVHUYLHQFH WR WKH PRUH SRZHUIXO ZKLWH HVW
QHFHVVDU\ IUHHGRP LQ OLIH WKDW PDGH WKH $IULF
&ODUN +LQH DQG .DWKOHHQ 7KRPSVRQ SXW LW EHV
ZRPHQ@ ZHUH ZLOOLQJ WR SD\ D KLJK SULFH IRU W
IUHHGRP ´ 7KH VRXWKHUQ EODFN ZRPDQ ZRUNHG XQ
RI EHLQJ DSP HULFDQ ZRPDQ LQGHWKHRXWKLQHRWKH
WKDW ZDV VR LPSRUWDQW WR KHU

6 H [X D O , G H Q W L W \

Universal Churches and the Role of Religion in Arnold J. Toynbee’s A Study of History

Phyllis Amenda

Introduction

5HOLJLRQ KDV DOZD\V EHHQ WKH FRUHUVWRQH RI KXPDQ VRFLHWLHV DQG FLYLOL]DWLRQV ORRN IRU DQ H[SODQDWLRQ RI KRZ RZQ SODFH LQ WKDW ZRUOG 1R ZRUOG KLVWRULDQ VRFLHWLHV RU D JOREDO XQLYHUVH ZLWKRXW WKHLU VSHFLILF FXOWXUH GLYLQH KDV SOD\HG LQ WKH KXPDQ VWRU\

$UQROG - 7R\QEHH SDLG SDUWLFXODU DWWHQWLRQ RI KLV WZHOYH YROXPH ZRUN $ 6WXG\ RI +LVWRU\ WKHRHO DWLRQVKLS EHWZHHQ ZKDW KH FDOOHG XQLYH 7R\QEHH¶V LQWHUHVW LQ UHOLJLRQ PLUURUHG WKH 9RO XP9H,VZ,HUH SXEOLVKHG LQ DQG KDYH OLWWOH GHYHORSPHQWLDO SDUDGL;JPZH7KHHSXE[OLVKXH ILIWHHQ \HDUV DIWHU WKH ILUVW VL[LQ 7R\QE

4>1<0057>3<00400700036<0003>150

WR ORRN DW YDULRXV VRFLDO JURXSV ZKLFK FRPSU
DV ZHOO DV ³LQWHUQDO SUROHWDULDWV ´

,Q XVLQJ WKH WHUP ³SUROHWDULDWV ´ 7R\QEHH GU

GHULYHG IURP D /DWLQ ZRUG FRLQHG IRU WKH VWDV

KXPDQ FRPPXQLW\ ZKHUHDV D µKLJKHU UHOLJLRQ¶ FRQFHLYHG RI DV WUDQVFHQGLQJ WKH ZKROH RI KX 0DWHULDOLVH 8VH ´)RU 7R\QEHH LW LV WKH VWXG\ RI UROH LQ FLYLOL]DWLRQ WKDW ZLOO EHFRPH D ODUJ +LVWRU\

%UHDNGRZQ DQG WKH 5LVH RI 8QLYHUVDO 6WDWHV

,Q 7R\QEHH¶V 5HVHDUFK &HQWHU DSSOLP FUHDWLYH UHVSRQ FKDOOHQJHV IDFLQJ D VRFLHW\ HQDEOH D VRFLHW\ WKURXJK WKH FKDOOHQJHV LV FDOOHG WKH FUHDWL VXSHUPHQ LQ WKH 1LHW]FKHDQ VHQVH EH WKH RQ WKH DVFHQGDQW SKDVH RI LWV HYROXWLRQ %X ORVHV LWV HGJH IRU VRPH UHDVRQ QR ORQJHU KDV ZKLFK DUH QHHGHG WR PHDVXUH WKH FUL XQLTXHQHVV" 7R\QEHH FDOOV WKLV SRLQW ³EU 0LPHVLV SDUDGLJP &RVWHOOR GHILQHV WKLV DV ³W RFFXUV LQ WKH PRUDO IDLOXUH RI WKH OHDGLQJ PL WKHLU SRWHQWLDO VXFFHVVRUV ´ 7KH FUHDWLYH PL GRPLQDQW PLQRULW\ EXW ZKHQ WKH GRPLQDQW PL UHVSRQVH RI WKH SUROHWDULDW WKH LQWHUQDO SUROHWDULDW EHJLQV VHHNLQJ IRU UHSODFH WKH ULJLG XQVDWLVI\LQJ JRGV WKDW KD PLQRULW\

7KH SROLW\ WKDW LV FRQWUROOHG E\ D GRPLQDQ L

7KH SDUDGR[RI XQLYHUVDO VWDWHV LV WKDW WKH\ WKH\ DUH DERXW WR FRPPLW HXWKDQDVLD DQG VXF RQH QHHGV RQO\ ORRN DW WKH 5RPDQ (PSLUH RU W DSSHDUHG LPPRUWDO WKH\ KDG DOUHDG\ HVWDEOLVKHG, R 7R\QEHH YLHZV WKH XQLYHUVDO VWDWH DV FLYLOL] YLUWXH WR WKHP" +H ILQGV WZR SXUSRVHV RI WKH SHDFHPDNHU ³:KHUHDV SDURFKLDO VWDWHV SHU\ LQWR H[LVWHQFH WR SXW D VWRS WR WKH GRVH VHFRQG SXUSRVH LV WR VSHQG LWVHOI LQ VHUYLFH TXHVWLRQ :KR DUH LWV EHQHILFLDULHV RQO\ WKUHH FKRLFHV D FRQWHPSRUDU\ DOLHQ FLY LQWHUQDO SUROHWDULDW ³DQG LQ VHUYLQJ WKH L PLQLVWHULQJ WR RQH RI WKH KLJKHU RQ WKH SUROHWDULDW¶V ERVRP ´

,W LV LQ VHUYLQJ WKH KLJKHU UHOLJLRQV WKDW IL XQLYHUVDO VWDWHV ILQG WKHLU KLJKHVW SXUSRVH XQLYHUVDO VWDWHV SURYLGH WKH FRQGLWLRQV RU IORXULVK"

$V PHQWLRQHG DERYH WKH ILUVW EHQHILW SURYLG ERWK LQWHUQDO DQG H[WHUQDO WKUHDWV 7R\QEH 3HDFH ´ 7R\QEHH FODLPV LQ WKDW WKH ZRUOG EHOLHYHV LQ PLQRULW\ LV XQDEOH WR LPSRVH D ³IDQF\ UHOLJLR ³SDFLILF DWPRVSKHUH´ ZLOO DOORZ LQWHUQDO SUR IURP EHORZ XSZDUGV %RWK WKH IUHBV

YLHZ WKH SULPDU\ EHQHILFLDU\ RI D XQLYHUVDO VW
UHOLJLRQ WKDW DULVHV IURP LW +DOIZD\ WKURXJK
VHFWLRQ HQWLWOHG ³8QLYHUVDO &KXUFKHV ´ ,W LV
7R\QEHH¶V WKRXJKW DIWHU :RUOG :DU ,, EHFRPHV P
GLVFXVVLQJ SDVW FLYLOL]DWLRQV DQG GIDWWHPSWLQ
GHYHORSPHQW LW LV FOHDU WKDW 7R\QEHH¶V IRFX
H[LVWHQFH

2QH UHDVRQ IRU 7R\QEHH¶V HPSKDVLV RQ ZDUHOLJLRQ
LQWHOOHFWXDO WKRXJKW RI VSLULWGXDOWYKDHOXZRUV
RI SULPLWLYH QDWXUH IRUWK&HZRUVKLSSHUWKWUDI
QDWXUH ³IURP DQ REMHFW RI ZRUVKLS LQWR DQ REM
VXFK LGRODWU\ LV WKH PHVVDJH RI WKH KLJKHU UH

7KH PHVVDJH RI WKH KLJKHU UHOLJLRQV KDG EHHQ
WÀ\€QRDQ‡KC¤HV¤EVaDWXpUHKDQG WKLV PHVVDJH KDG ZRQ 0DQ

FODLPLQJ WKDW *LEERQ PLVUHDG WKH SRLQW RI EU
(PSLUH RU DV 7R\QEHH ZRXOG VD\ WKH +HOOHQLF
EUHDNGRZQ ORQJ EHIRUH WKH HQWUDQFH RI &KULV
+HOOHQLF FLYLOL]DWLRQ &KULVWLDQLW\ DQG RWKH
PDUNHW LQ 5RPH IRU WKHLU LGHDV

6LU -DPHV *HRUJH)UD]HU¶V *ROGHQ %RXJK
WKH SDUDVLWLF QDWXUH RI &KULVWLDQLW\ DQG FH
OHQJWK\ TXRWDWLRQ IURP 7KH *ROGHQ %RXJK LQ Z
UHOLJLRQV FRPSHWHO\ XQGHUPLQHG WKH ³FRQFHS
LQGLYLGXDO WR WKH FRPPXQLW\´ DQG UHSODFHG LV
RI LQGLYLGXDO VDOYDWLRQ 7KH VHOHFWLRQ TXRW
UHYLYDO RI FODVVLFLVP LQ WKH VHQDLVVDQFH ZDV
YLUWXH LQ WKH PRGHUQ ZRUOG $FFRUGLQJ WR)UD

7KH UHYLYDO RI 5RPDQ /DZ RI WKH $ULVWRWHOLDQ
DW WKH FORVH RI WKH 0LGGOH $JHV PDUNHG WKH U
DQG FRQGXFW WR VDQHU PDQOLHU YLHZV RI WKH Z
FLYLOL]DWLRQ ZDV RYHU 7KH WLGH RI 2ULHQWDO L

7R ZKLFK 7R\QEHH LURQLFDOO\ UHSOLHV

,W ZDV LQGHHG VWLOO HEELQJ RQ WKH WK 0DU
ZRQGHULQJ ZKDW WKDW JHQWOH VFKRODU ZRXOG KL
LQ ZKLFK (XURSH¶V UHWXUQ WR µQDWLYH LGHDOV R
GXULQJ WKH QH[W \HDUV WKDW KDG QRZ SDVVHG VLQFH

7R\QEHH VHHV D VWUDLJKW OLQH EHWZHHQ WKH³IUD
*LEERQ)UD]HU WR WKH ³GHPRQLF GHVSRQGHQF\ YLR
+LWOHU¶V *HUPDQ\

7R\QEHH DUJXHV WKDW WKH ORYH RI *RG DQG ORYH
KLJKHU UHOLJLRQV DQG WKHUHIRUH GRLQJ RQH ZLO
EHWZHHQ WKH SDJDQ DQG WKH &KULVWLDQ RU WKH
&KULVWLDQ FDQ VHH EH\RQG KLV RZQ VPDOO NLQJG
WKH ZLOO RI *RG RQ HDUWK WKH &KULVWLDQ LV VK
PLQHG SDJDQ DQG WKHUHIRUH KDV D JUHDWHU FKDQ
WDUJHW +H TXRWHV 5REHUW %URZQLQJ ³$K EXW D
2U ZKDW¶V D KHDYHQ IRU"´

$V DQ H[DPSOH RI WKDW JRDO RI VHHLQJ PDQ E\
RI 6DLQW 'DQLHO WKH 6W\OLWH D 6\ULDQ DQFKRUL

&RQVWDQWLQRSOH WR VDYH WKH &KULVWLDQ IDLWK
H[DPSOH WR WKH +LQGX VDJH 3XUXQ %DJKDW ZKR
DQ LPSHQGLQJ ODQGVOLGH WKXV VDYLQJ WKHLU OL
LVRODWLRQ WR EHWWHU FRQWHPSODWH WKH GLYLQ
WKH\ JODGO\ UHWXUQHG WR WKH ZRUOG WR VHUYH
XQGHUVWDQGLQJ RI GLYLQH SURYLGHQFH

+DYLQJ PDGH KLV FDVH DJDLQVW *LEERQ DQG)UD]HU
XQLYHUVDO VWDWH 7R\QEHH VHHNV WR H[SORUH WH
D ³KLJKHU VSHFLHV´ WKDW KDV HYROYHG EH\RQG
QHHG WR XQGHUVWDQG ZKDW 7R\QEHH PHDQV E\ ³KL
UHOLJLRQV KDYH SOD\HG LQ WKH HYROXWLRQ RI VR

5HOLJLRQ DQG 6RFLHW\

,Q KLV FKDSWHU ³&KXUFKHV DV D +LJKHU 6SHFLHV
EHWZHHQ ZKDW KH FDOOV ³ORZHU UHOLJLRQV´ DQG
RI UHOLJLRXV GHYHORSPHQW KDYH GLIIHUHQW W\SH
PLQRULW\ DQG WKH VWDWH DSSDUDWXV WKH\ H[VW
GLIIHUHQW UHODWLRQVKLSV ZLWK UDWLRQDOLVP DQ
WKHVH VWDJHV DQG ZK\ WKH FRQIOLFW ZLWK UDWLR
SRZHUIXO SROHPLF IRU PDQ¶ZRUHVHG SRI UHOLJLRXV

/RZHU 5HOLJLRQV

$V PHQWLRQHG HDUOLHU 7R\QEHH LGHQWLILHV ORZ
KLJKHU UHOLJLRQV YLHZ WKH GHLW\ DV D JOREDO X
DQ LQGLYLGXDO WULEH RU QDWLRQ WR EHFRPH HOLJLRQ
E\SURGXFW RI SDURFKLDO VWDWHV EXW ³WKH HVWD
WKH UDLVRQ G¶rWUH RI WKHVH UHOLJLRQV ´7KH
EHOLHI EHFDXVH WKH SRLQW WKDW [ZHUH EXW
QNL J€ŠŽ‚ŠQE H[SODEkQVW ŽHOSG1WK RQ3Ê[DWKHE\5A°J
EHOE•OEp0pU H¨H¦H W WUU VKH @ ' P @ ¥P Up0@Q

&RQIXFLXV ZKR UHFRQFLOHG KLV PRUDO SKLORVRSK
UHOLJLRQ E\ SUHVHQWLQJ KLV LGHDV DV WKH PHDQ
7R\QEHH¶V SUHVHQWDWLRQ RI SULPLWLYH UHOLJLR
WKHLU QRYHOW\ ZDV WKH HPSKDVLV RQ EHOLHI RYH
WR DV WKH ³SDUDGR[´ WKDW WKH JUHDWHVW DGYD
DV ODSVHV LQ UHOLJLRQ E\ WKHLU LQRXHQGXOLW\ RQ
3RPSH\ ZKHQ KH IRXQG QR REMHFW RI ZRUVKLS LQ
FKDUJHV RI DWKHLVP DJDLQVW HDUO\ &KULVWLDQV
GHQRXQFHG WKHVH VDPH &KULVWLDQV DV EODVSKHP

7KH 6XSHULRULW\ RI WKH 5H

,I WKHVH HDUO\ &KULVWLDQV ZHUH QRW ERXQG E\ W
SDJDQV WKHQ ZKDW ZDV WKHLU DSSHDO" /LNHZLVH
6LGGKDUWKD EHFRPH WKH %XGGKLVW UHOLJLRQ RI
WKH ULVH RI WKH KLJKHU UHOLJLRQV"

7R\QEHH LV REYLRXVO\ QRW RQO\ WKH QHZHVW

:KHQ WKH KRXVH WKDW 0DQ KDV EXLOW IRU KLPVHO
KLPVHOI VWDQGLQJ DJDLQ LQ WKH RSHQ DW WKH PH
VWDQGLQJ DJDLQ IDFH WR IDFH ZLWK D *RG ZKRVH S
KLGGHQ IURP 0DQ¶V H\HV E\ SULVRQ ZDOOV RI 0DQ¶

,I 7R\QEHH VHHPV WR KDYH SXW

LQFOXGHG ERWK :RUOG :DUV WKHQ KH KDV KRSH IR

,I WKLV LV WKH WUXWK WKH LQWHUUHJQD ZKLFK SX
EHWZHHQ WKH VXEPHUJHQFH

H[SHFWHG WR KDYH DV WKHLU FRXQWHUSDUWV LQ
RU SDXVHV LQ WKH SXOVDWLRQ RI OLIH EXW IODVK
EXUVWV RI IHUYHQW VSLULWXDO DFWLYLW\

5HOLJLRXV LQVLJKWV FRPH RXW RI WURXEOHG WLPH
VRFLHWLHV DUH LQGLYLGXDO HYHQ ZKLOH WKH\ IRO
IDOO (DFK FLYLOL]DWLRQ¶V WURXEOHV DUH XQLTXH
ZLOO KLJKOLJKW D GLIIHUHQW IDFHW RI WKH 'HLW\

7R\QEHH KDV PDGH D FDVH IRU FKXUFKHV VSULQJLQ
PLJKW WKLQJV ZRUN WKH RWKHU ZD\" &RXOG FKXUF
FLYLOL]DWLRQV" 7R\QEHH DUJXHV WKDW KLVWRULDQV
VXEMHFW ZLOO IXUWKHU LOOXPLQDWH WKH LPSRUWD

%LUWK RXW RI 'HDWK &KXUFKHV DQG WKH &UHDWLR

,I WKH XQLYHUVDO VWDWH LV DOUHDG\ G\LQJ E\ WKH
XQLYHUVDO FKXUFK WKHQ ZKDW UROH GRHV UHOLJLRQ
FLYLOL]DWLRQ DQG WKH ELUWK RI D QHZ RQH" 7R\QE
FKU\VDOLV IRU QHZ FLYLOL]DWLRQV 7R\QEHH FRQIH
WKLVDZDVRQ G¶rWUH IRU XQLYHUVDO FKXUFKHV EXW
KDG FRPH WR EHOLHYH WKDW XQLYHUVDO FKXUFKHV
$V PHQWLRQHG EHIRUH LW LV REYLRXV WKDW WKH
VLJQLILFDQW HIIHFW L

7R\QEHH FODLPV WKDW DOO RI WKH H[WDQW FLYLOL]
FLYLOL]DWLRQV WKURXJKRXW WKH FKXUFKV DQG
&KULVWLDQ FLYLOL]DWLRQV EDFN WR WKH +HOOHQL
(DVW EDFN WR WKH 6LQLF WKURXJK 0DKD\DQD WKH
WKURXJK ,VODP WR WKH HDVW WKH RIIVKRRWV RI
FLYLOL]DWLRQV ZHUH SUHVHUYHG LQ D UHOLJLRXV
DQG VHYHUDO RIIVKRRWV RI %XGGKLVP

7KH WUDQVLWLRQ SURFHVV IURP ROG FLYLOL]DWLRQ
³FRQFHSWXDO´ RYHU RI WKH FKXUFK ,Q WKLV SKDVH WKH
RXW D WLPH RI WURXEOHV 7KH VWDWH KDV VHL]HG
SRSXODWLRQ DV DQ LQWHUQDO SUROHWDULDW 7KH
HFKDQJH IRU SHDFH DQG VDIHW\ EXW WKH\ KDYH SD
IUXVWUDWLRQ D ORVV RI WKDW FUHDWLYH LPSXOVH
PRGHUQ SV\FKRORJLVWV FDOO ³OLELGR´ EHFDXVH
VHHN H[SUHVVLRQ DQG RQH ZD\ LW GRHV VR LV LQ
0DFDXOH\ ³,W >&KULVWLDQLW\@ H[FLWHG DOO WKH
TXLHW DQG OLVWOHVV SRSXODWLRQ RI DQ RYHUJUR
WR EH WXUQHG RYHU OLNH VKHHS IURP W\UDQW WR
UHEHOV ´

,Q WKLV ILUVW FRQFHSWLYH SKDVH RI WKH FKU\VDO
FUHDWLYLW\ RI WKH PDVVHV 7KH VXFFHVVIXO VWDWHV
HQHUJLHV DQG XVH WKHP WR IXUWKHU WKHLU PHVVL
FKDQQHO WKHVH XQOHDVKHG HQHUJLHV LW HQWHU
WKH XQLYHUVDO VWDWH RI 7KLQJ SKDVH ,Q WKLV
7R\QEHH FRPSDUHV WKLV WR WKH EXLOGLQJ RI VHFX
EXLOGLQJ RI WKH FLYLOL]DWLRQ 7KH XQLYHUVDO V
F QL`W • ÆWWK`p

XQLYHUVDO FKXUFKHV LV WKH YHKLFOHLE\UZKLFK W
FLYLOL]DWLRQ ZLOO FURVV WKH DE\VV EHWZHHQ WK

2QFH WKH ROG XQLYHUVDO VWDWH LV GHDG DQG JR

,Q DQDO\]LQJ 7R\QEHH¶V FRQFHSW RI WKH FKU\VDOL
WKDW KH WKRXJKW LW ZDV :KLOH 7R\QEHH¶V VWOLVW
VHFRQGDU\ UHOLJLRQV DUH SXUHO\ GHULYDWLYH RI
,VODP 0DKD\DQD DQG +LQGXLVP /RRNLQJ DW WKLV

YHU\ VLPSOH SDUDGLJPWR\ RUDQH FDQ GLYH LQ W
SODFH DQG ORRN IRU SDWWHUQV RI KLVWRU\ :KLOH
+ * :HOOV RU 7R\QEHH ZURWH WKDW SXUSRUWH
UHDOLW\ WKH\ IDLOHG WR (QWHU ZLWK EHFRQH G RQO\ I
SHULRGV LQ WKH PRVW VXSHUILFLDO PDQQHU

7KH ODWHU YROXPHV RI $ 6WXG\ RI +LVWRU\ EHFRPH
WKH JDSLQJ DE\VV IDFLQJ :HVWHUQ PDQ +H XVHG K
XQLYHUVDO DXDE KHV DQG SURORHWDULDWV WR XUJH KLV U
WKH :HVWHUQ ZRUOG NLOOV LWVHOI LQ DQ RUJ\ RI
HVFKDWRORJLFDO XUJHQF\ RYHUZKHOPV 7R\QEHH 7
IRU WKH ZRUOG KLVWRULDQ 7R\QEHH LV QRW WKH P
XVHG D ZRUOG KLVWRU\ WR SURPXOJDWH KLV LQGLY
VWDWH 2VZDOG 6SHQJOHU ILJXUHG WKDW WKH :HVW
3LWLULP 6RURNLQ ZDQWHG HYHU\RQH WR VKDNH RII
ORYH HDFK RWKHU ,PPDQXHO :DOOHUVWHLQ ZDQWV
&DSLWDOLVW6WWHPUVRG ZH FDQ VWRS H[SORLWLQJ WKH
0DU[LVW SHDFH DQG KDUPRQ\

7KHHTXWLRQ EHFRPHV QRW LI D ZRUOG KLVWRULDQ
GLVFLSOLQH DSSHDU WR GHPDQG RQH $UQROG - 7R
DQVZHU WR WKLV TXHVWLRQ 7R VWXG\ D YHU\ ODUJ
WLPHQRHQGV VRPH NLQG RI RUQDQL]LQJ YLHZ7KHH TXHV
PDQ\ FLYLOL]DWLRQV RYHU WKH FRXUVH RI KXPDQ K
QDUUDWLYH EXW DQ DOO HQFRPSDVVLQJ YLVLRQ RI
WKLV NLQG RI HQFRPSDVVLQJ YLVLRQ RXQGDWLRQ
0DU[LVP 5HOLJLRXV YLVLRQV ZKHWKHU RI WKH RYHU
RU WKH SXWDWLYHO\ PDWHULDOLVW YDULHW\ VXFK
KDYH D YLVLRQ RI ZKHUH PDQNLQG LV JRLQJ DQG ZK

7R\QEHH¶V YLVLRQ LV URRWHG LQ KLV &KULVWLDQL
URRWHG LQ WKH VLPLODULWLHV EHWZHHQ WKH RWKH
YLVLRQ RI KHLHWRUH LEV QRWXUH UHOLJLRXV ,Q D VS
RU PDQ¶V DWWHPSWV WR ILQG *RG UHOLJLRQ ZLO
VXUSULVLQJ WKDW KH FKDQJHG FRXUVH LQ KLV YLH
9,, *LYHQ WKH FDODPLW\ WKDW ZDV (XURSH GXULQ
WKRVH YROXPHV LW ZRXOG KDYH EHHQ PRUH VXUSU
EHFDXVH LW ZRXOG KDYH PHDQW WKDW 7R\QEHH KD
KLVWRULDKQXPEDXQWEDLQJ